#### **MINUTES**

#### CITY PLAN COMMISSION/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW BOARD

May 21, 2007

A meeting of the City Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board of the City of Clayton, Missouri, met upon the above date at 5:30 p.m., Chairman Harold Sanger presiding. Upon roll call, the following responded:

## Present

Harold Sanger, Chairman Michael A. Schoedel, City Manager Steve Lichtenfeld, Aldermanic Representative James Liberman Debbie Igielnik Marc Lopata

## Absent:

Mark Zorensky

## Also Present:

Catherine Powers, Director of Planning & Development Services Jason Jaggi, Planner

Chairman Sanger welcomed everyone to the meeting and asked that conversations not take place during the meeting and that all cell phone and pager ringers be turned off.

# $\underline{\text{MINUTES}}$ – SPECIAL MEETING OF MAY $1^{\text{ST}}, 2007$ AND REGULAR MEETING OF MAY $7^{\text{TH}}, 2007$

The minutes of the special meeting of May 1, 2007 were presented for approval. Steve Lichtenfeld asked that the word "elevators" be changed to "escalators" for the following paragraph/sentence on Page 5: "Mr. Wislow stated that there will be covered elevators." The minutes were approved, as amended, after having been previously distributed to each individual member.

The minutes of the regular meeting of May 7, 2007 were presented for approval. The minutes were approved after having been previously distributed to each individual member.

## <u>IMPERVIOUS COVERAGE MODIFICATION - DETACHED GARAGE - 7511</u> <u>WESTMORELAND</u>

Catherine Powers announced that the applicant has asked that this item be withdrawn from this agenda and that a copy of the letter requesting removal has been provided to each member.

## <u>CONDITIONAL USE PERMIT – SPECIALTY MARKET – EXTRA VIRGIN, AN OLIVE</u> OVATION – 143 CARONDELET PLAZA (THE CRESCENT)

Ms. Marianne Prey, owner/manager of Extra Virgin, an Olive Ovation, LLC, was in attendance at the meeting.

Catherine Powers explained that this is a request for a Conditional Use Permit to operate a 1,187 square foot gourmet market featuring olive tasting and a variety of olive related products. There will be no cooking on site. This business is a hybrid of the definition of a restaurant and grocery store; however, both require a Conditional Use Permit. The proposed hours of operation are 10:00 a.m. to 6:00 p.m. Monday through Saturday. Deliveries will be made to the building's loading dock and hand trucked through the market's front door. The proposed market will not offer delivery service. Trash dumpsters are those to be used for the retail portion of the building. Parking will be provided for customers in The Crescent's garage.

Ms. Prey thanked the Commission for the opportunity to present her proposal. She stated this specialty food market, featuring an olive oil tasting bar, is a concept new to the St. Louis area. A proposed floor plan was presented. Ms. Prey explained that when one enters the store, the theme will be that of an old world European market featuring a stone floor, outdoor atmosphere and worn wood. Pergola, for decorative purposes, will be suspended from the ceiling and a decorative stainless steel container will house bulk oils. She stated that samples of domestic and international olive oils will be offered, much like wine tasting and that there will also be a bulk olive bar as well as olives pre-packaged in jars.

Chairman Sanger asked if this is a franchise.

Ms. Prey replied "no"; however, there are similar markets in California and Chicago.

Chairman Sanger stated this is a great idea.

Marc Lopata asked if bread will offered.

Ms. Prey replied "yes".

Being no further questions or comments, Mike Schoedel made a motion to recommend approval of the Conditional Use Permit to the Board of Aldermen. The motion was seconded by Debbie Igielnik and unanimously approved by the members.

## BOUNDARY ADJUSTMENT – 37 & 41 CRESTWOOD

Mr. Mark Ditch, surveyor representing the property owners, was in attendance at the meeting.

Catherine Powers explained that this adjustment is being requested due to the location of the existing fence between the two lots and the continued maintenance and improvements of the adjoining yard areas. The plat, as presented, will create minor adjustments along the side property lines of Lots 8 and Lot 9 of the Claverach Park subdivision. The boundary adjustment will convey 282 square feet of Lot 8 to Lot 9. The applicant has obtained approval of the plat from the owners of both affected properties. Catherine stated that staff recommends approval of the plat with the condition that the applicant provide a Mylar for the appropriate City of Clayton signatures per the Subdivision Ordinance.

Chairman Sanger asked Mr. Ditch if this adjustment is being requested because of the existing fence.

Mr. Ditch replied "yes".

Being no further questions or comments, Steve Lichtenfeld made a motion to approve the boundary adjustment per staff recommendation. The motion was seconded by Jim Liberman and unanimously approved by the members.

## IMPERVIOUS COVERAGE MODIFICATION – WALKWAY – 325 N. CENTRAL AVE.

Katie Wibbenmeyer, project architect, was in attendance at the meeting.

Catherine Powers explained that this is a request for modification to Section 16.7 of the City's Zoning Ordinance to allow impervious coverage to exceed the 55% maximum. In cases whereby an applicant can demonstrate just cause, the Plan Commission has the authority to approve a modification up to an additional 5% coverage (for a maximum not to exceed 60%). In this instance, the applicant is requesting an additional 2% coverage for a total lot impervious coverage of 57% so a new walkway can be installed from the front sidewalk to the rear entry to the home. A letter has been submitted from the applicant indicating the need for the proposed walkway to provide easier access for the homeowner's elderly mother. Catherine indicated that the proposal is for the installation of a 32" wide permeable paver walkway leading from the front walk along the south side of the property to the rear entrance to the home. A grade change at the front end of the new walk will require a new retaining wall and the applicant is proposing a stacked stone wall for this purpose. Catherine advised the members that the applicant has considered alternatives so as not to increase impervious coverage including the installation of an elevator; however this option is not feasible. Staff is of the opinion that there is just cause for the increased coverage given the site conditions and the need to provide accessibility to the home and therefore, staff recommends approval of the impervious coverage modification.

Ms. Wibbenmeyer presented a sample of the permeable paver.

Chairman Sanger asked the size of the pavers.

Ms. Wibbenmeyer replied "15" X 23"."

Chairman Sanger asked if a wheelchair can be rolled over this material.

Ms. Wibbenmeyer replied "yes".

Chairman Sanger asked for confirmation that no credit is given for use of permeable pavers.

Catherine Powers indicated that is correct; however, their use will help mitigate the situation somewhat.

Debbie Igielnik asked how the grass is cut.

Ms. Wibbenmeyer indicated that it is cut with a weed eater.

Jim Liberman asked if the neighbor to the south has reviewed the plans.

Catherine Powers reminded the members that notification is sent by City staff to all property owners within 200 feet of each agenda item.

Marc Lopata commented that he spoke with the owner of the subject property and she has stated that she talked with the neighbors who have no objections.

Jim Liberman indicated that he is not crazy about going over the allotted 55%. He asked if a condition can be placed on the approval requiring that this walkway be removed if the present owners sell the property.

Chairman Sanger stated that they are making an effort to have pervious material versus impervious (by use of permeable pavers).

Marc Lopata stated that he looked at the site and that the walkway will be about 6 feet from the property line. He stated he is concerned about the loss of trees, as some will have to be removed to install this walkway.

Ms. Wibbenmeyer indicated that there are two trees that will have to be removed.

Marc Lopata indicated that two, 20 foot tall trees will have to come out as well as six holly bushes.

Catherine Powers stated that replacement of those two trees could be required.

Chairman Sanger asked if there is room on the site to plant new trees.

Marc Lopata indicated that he did not know, as the site is pretty heavily landscaped already.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if the 32" width is sufficient enough to move a wheelchair around.

Ms. Wibbenmeyer replied "yes". She stated that the owner's mother is in a smaller wheelchair.

Marc Lopata commented that this will be a steep push up the hill.

Ms. Wibbenmeyer agreed.

Being no further questions or comments, Marc Lopata made a motion to approve with the condition that lost deciduous trees be replaced on site per staff review and approval. The motion was seconded by Steve Lichtenfeld and unanimously approved by the members.

Marc Lopata noted that the College School in Webster Groves has a nice permeable paver material.

## <u>SITE PLAN REVIEW/ARCHITECTURAL REVIEW – ADDITION AND DETACHED</u> GARAGE – 21 ARUNDEL

Douglas Julien, project architect and Dennis Upshaw, owner, were in attendance at the meeting.

Catherine Powers stated that the project consists of the construction of a 1,018 square foot two story, 28'-8" in height addition to the rear of the existing 2,100 square foot structure and the construction of a new 688 square foot detached garage at the rear of the site. The applicant will pipe storm water to an existing storm sewer. New underground electrical service will be provided per City regulations. Trash will be stored in a trash enclosure on the side of the garage. The HVAC units are located under the rear wood deck and screened with lattice. Existing impervious coverage is 53.4%. The new construction will add 1.3% coverage for a total lot impervious coverage of 54.7%. No trees will be removed as a result of this project. Two (2) trees will be protected per City of Clayton Standards. Catherine stated that staff's recommendation is to approve as submitted.

Mr. Julien indicated that the owners are requesting an expansion to their existing home to provide ample space for themselves and their three children. He stated the project also includes the removal of the existing attached rear entry garage to make way for the addition and as such, are not significantly increasing the amount of impervious coverage. He stated they are also going to plant additional landscaping. He asked if there were any questions.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if the garage has two sets of doors.

Mr. Julien replied "yes". He stated it will be a drive through garage.

Marc Lopata asked about grading.

Mr. Julien indicated that the site will stay pretty much the way it is now.

Marc Lopata stated that he has an issue with putting the condensers under the deck. He asked if they could be relocated.

Mr. Upshaw stated he was thinking about putting a grate on the deck; he believes having the units under the deck is better than placing them 15 feet away from the house.

Marc Lopata suggested he reconsider relocating the units.

Chairman Sanger stated that is a point of information and not up to us to design.

Being no further questions or comments, Debbie Igielnik made a motion to approve as submitted. The motion was seconded by Steve Lichtenfeld and unanimously approved by the members.

The architectural aspects of the project were now up for review.

Mr. Julien indicated that they went to great lengths to match the existing brick. A sample of brick that will be salvaged from the existing garage to be used for the addition was presented. He stated the garage is different in that it is detached and about 50 feet away from the house. A sample of brick they would like to use for the new detached was also presented. Mr. Julien indicated that the existing home has a flat terra cotta clay roof, but that they would like to use architectural shingle, terra cotta in color (sample presented), for the addition and garage. He also presented a sample of a more restrained color shingle, in the event the Board would prefer that color.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if the clay tile roof is square or rectangular in shape.

Mr. Julien indicated that it is rectangular.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if a rectangular shaped cut for the new roofing was considered.

Mr. Julien stated the new roofing will not be that visible.

Steve Lichtenfeld stated he would like to recommend a rectangular shape for the new roof.

Jim Liberman commented that he believes the orange color will be very "strong".

Mr. Julien indicated he is not sure it is available in a 3-tab shingle.

Debbie Igielnik asked if they have thought about the amount of orange color.

Mr. Upshaw replied "yes".

Mr. Julien stated that one cannot really see the gable roof from the street. He stated that if the terra cotta color is a problem, they can use a more restrained color.

Steve Lichtenfeld stated the roof choice could be left to staff.

Catherine Powers concurred.

Jim Liberman commented that the plans indicate a choice for the railing. He has if a decision has been made.

Mr. Julien indicated that it will most likely be the powder coated steel.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if the brick salvaged from the existing garage will be enough for the new addition.

Mr. Julien indicated that he is not sure the existing brick is salvageable and that he proposes to mix the new brick with whatever brick from the existing garage is salvageable to match as closely as possible.

Being no further questions or comments, Jim Liberman made a motion to approve the project with the condition that the roofing material be a 3-tab, tile-like, brown color shingle to be reviewed and approved by staff. The motion was seconded by Debbie Igielnik and unanimously approved by the Board.

## OUTDOOR DINING – CANDICCI'S – 16 S. BEMISTON

Robert Candice, restaurant owner, was in attendance at the meeting.

Catherine Powers explained that this is a request to operate outdoor dining on the front of the restaurant along Bemiston Avenue. The applicant will provide 15 seats at 4 tables on the sidewalk. In addition, the applicant is proposing 2 tables on the raised patio adjacent to the entry. The proposed tables are black wrought iron, measuring 24 inches in diameter. The chairs are also proposed to be wrought iron. A 30-inch high metal pedestrian barrier is proposed to separate the dining area from pedestrian traffic. The plans indicate that the minimum clearance of 4-feet from the street tree to the barrier is being provided. At this time, no umbrellas are proposed for the outdoor dining area. Staff recommends approval with the conditions that the applicant install a permanent railing on the raised platform prior to the issuance of the Outdoor Dining Permit and that the applicant apply for and receive the annual Outdoor Dining Permit providing liability insurance to the City prior to operating the outdoor dining.

Mr. Candice presented a sample of the furniture. (Note that the table presented was square; not round).

Jim Liberman asked if there are already tables and chairs set out.

Jason Jaggi advised the members that Mr. Candice was previously received approval to participate in the extended outdoor dining during evening hours.

Chairman Sanger commented that if he remembers correctly, Mr. Candice was the first restaurant owner to request outdoor dining several years ago.

Mr. Candice agreed.

Jim Liberman asked that no tables be allowed on the platform.

Discussion ensued regarding the placement of tables/chairs and a railing on the platform.

Jim Liberman made a motion to approve the outdoor dining with the condition that no tables/chairs be placed on the platform and that the installation of a railing be at the discretion of the restaurant owner. The motion was seconded by Mike Schoedel.

Chairman Sanger asked staff's opinion regarding this issue.

Catherine Powers indicated that staff would prefer that tables not be on the platform.

Mr. Candice asked, then, why the need for a railing.

Mike Schoedel advised Mr. Candice that if there are no tables on the platform, then there would be no need for the railing.

Catherine Powers commented that the platform area is very tight.

Steve Lichtenfeld asked if it would be better to put two tables up against the wall with the chairs opposing each other.

Steve Lichtenfeld commented that he thought the tables were to be 24" round, whereas the sample brought in seems larger (and is square).

After discussion, Jim Liberman withdrew his previous motion to approve with the condition that no tables be placed on the platform. Mike Schoedel withdrew his second to the motion.

Marc Lopata made a motion to approve as modified (with the platform tables against the wall and the installation of a railing). The motion was seconded by Debbie Igielnik and unanimously approved by the Board.

## OUTDOOR DINING - KD POPPA'S - 4 N. CENTRAL AVE.

This item was continued as no one was in attendance to make the presentation.

Being no further business for the Plan Commission/Architectural Review Board, this meeting adjourned at 6:35 p.m.

Recording Secretary	